

**The Comparison of Taiwan's Sustainable Hotel Managers'
Perspectives on The Condition of Domestic Sustainable
Tourism**

By

Syuan-ru Liou

劉軒如

Submitted to the Faculty of
Department of International Affairs in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of
Bachelor of Arts in International Affairs

Wenzao Ursuline University of Languages
2020

WENZAO URSULINE UNIVERSITY OF LANGAUGES
DEPARTMENT OF INTERNATIONAL AFFAIRS

This senior paper was presented

by

Syuan-ru Liou

劉軒如

It was defended on

November 30th, 2019

and approved by

Reviewer 1: Shao-Tzu Wu, Assistant Professor, Department of International Affairs

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Reviewer 2 : Yu-Hsuan Lee, Assistant Professor, Department of International Affairs

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Adviser: Samuel C.Y. Ku, Professor, Master Progress on Southeast Asian Studies

Signature: _____ Date: _____

Copyright © by Syuan-ru Liou 劉軒如

2020

The Comparison of Taiwan's Sustainable Hotels Managers' Perspectives on The Condition of Domestic Sustainable Tourism

Syuan-Ru Liou

Wenzao Ursline University of Languages, 2020

Abstract

Sustainable development is a global trend. The United Nations set 17 goals for this issue. Also, there are many relevant certifications at home and abroad. People's demand for tourism and recreation have been increasing. Most of the dealers pay more attention on their own economic benefit. However, the environment and social culture are also harmed at the same time. The purpose of the study is to realize the experiences and perspectives about sustainable management of managers from two sustainable hotels which have got the GSTC certification. One is Toucheng leisure farm, and the other is Footprint inn. The methodology used in this study is interview. Then, infer the condition of domestic sustainable tourism by various aspects. The two sustainable hotels' philosophy, business model and hardship are very distinctive. The concept of sustainability has not been widespread among Taiwanese since their consuming recognition still focus on price-performance ratio. So, it needs to be package into different forms to educate consumers. The concrete benefit brought by practicing sustainability cannot be seen in short term. Obtaining GSTC certification is a starting point instead of an end point because the GSTC criteria can demonstrate the direction to improved continually.

Keywords: Sustainable tourism, Sustainable hotel, GSTC

TABLE OF CONTENTS

INTRODUCTION	1
Background.....	1
Motivation	2
Research Purpose.....	3
Research Questions	3
Contribution.....	3
LITERATURE REVIEW	4
Sustainable Tourism	4
Global Sustainable Tourism Council Criteria	5
Tourism 2020 Tourism 2020: A Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy	5
METHODOLOGY	6
DATA ANALYSIS.....	9
Sustainable Tourism’s Meaning	9
Business Model	9
Observation Of Domestic Operators’ Sustainability Awareness And Suggestion	10
Suggestions For Other Accommodation Operators.....	11
Expectation For Cooperation.....	11
Operators’ Influence On Consumers	12
Motivation For Certification.....	13
Difficulties Of Practicing Sustainable Tourism And Preparing For Certifications	13
Certification’S Influence	13
Attitudes For Other Certifications And Plans In The Future	14
Perspectives On The Government’S Policies Or Plans.....	14
Perspectives On The Government’S Travel Subsidy	15
Judging The Current Stage Of Taiwan's Sustainable Tourism.....	16
CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION	18
APPENDIX.....	20
BIBLIOGRAPHY	21

INTRODUCTION

Background

In Taiwan, people's demand for tourism and recreation have been increasing gradually because of the change in social and economic structure and the implementation of the two-day-off per week policy. Thus, Taiwan's tourism industry is flourishing. According to the government's report, there is an increasing trend of Taiwanese' travel ratio during 2017 to 2018.¹

Developing tourism business by combing local natural and humanistic resources with original industry activities can bring many benefits such as creating job opportunities, attracting investment, improving local constructing. Also, it can help develop the region and bring economic growth.²

Tourism development influences not only on residents' material life but also social values' change.³ Usually, developers pay more attention on tourists' and themselves' benefit instead of the locals' benefit. So, they take short term plans which can gain profit brought by large quantity of consumers. However, over environmental development and influx of superabundant tourists can cause negative effect on environment, society and economy. The accompanying destruction would lead to tourism construction lose incentive to consumers. Once people in one region rely too much on tourism related industry for living, their life and financial condition must be impacted inevitably. It should not be ignored. Many tourist areas

¹ 交通部觀光局，

<https://admin.taiwan.net.tw/Handlers/FileHandler.ashx?fid=90319cdb-c48e-4e18-8bd6-56188edb7203&type=4&no=1>，〈中華民國 107 年國人旅遊狀況調查〉。（民 108 年 7 月 1 日）

² 陳庭芸。「澎湖永續觀光發展之研究」。博士論文，中國文化大學地學研究所博士班，2013。

³ 張軒瑄、林俐吟。〈從永續觀光與旅遊地生命週期觀點論述九份地區觀光再發展策略〉。《休閒與遊憩研究》第 5 卷第 1 期(2013)：頁 1-31。2019 年 7 月 1 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。doi:10.6157/2013.5(1).1

were constructed without strict plan at initial stage, so there are some uncoverable damage.⁴

Sustainable development has been a global trend. To confront with this issue, UN set 17 goals.⁵ There are many relevant certifications at home and abroad. Also, people's eco-friendly cognition is upgraded. The concept of sustainable development is applied to tourism. There are more and more dealers feature their business with it. The Tourism Bureau, Ministry of Transportation and Communications also sets a plan called as Tourism 2020-Taiwan Sustainable Tourism Development Program.⁶ Because consumers are not satisfied with current tourism products. And they aware that the value of natural and cultural resources. It is important to preserving them. The application is necessary.⁷

Motivation

After traveling to many domestic tourist attractions, I found that most of them have been destroyed and polluted. Most people's behavioral patterns of travelling are different from usual behavioral patterns. Besides, tourist attractions lack of distinctive features to attract tourist to revisit. Since the tourism dealers usually design facilities, products and activities by imitation. In fact, Taiwan have abundant and unique tourism resources which need to be preserved. In recent years, more and more businesses are featured with certifications which are related sustainability. There are only two hotels get the CU-GSTC certification in Taiwan. I want to realize and contrast their managers' experience about practicing sustainability on management.

⁴ 欣傳媒，〈旅@天下-58期 封面故事／觀光走向永續 資源生生不息〉，
<https://solomo.xinmedia.com/globaltourismvision/131101>。（民 108 年 7 月 1 日）

⁵“About the Sustainable Development Goals,” Sustainable Development GOALS,
<https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/>（accessed April 20, 2019）.

⁶ 周永暉、歐陽忻憶、陳冠竹。〈台灣觀光 2020 永續發展策略〉。《台灣當代觀光》第 1 卷第 1 期（2018）：頁 1-20。2019 年 7 月 1 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。doi:10.6348/TMT.201809_1(1).0001

⁷ 李素馨。〈觀光新紀元—永續發展的選擇〉。《戶外遊憩研究》第 9 卷第 4 期（1996）：頁 1-17。2019 年 7 月 1 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。doi:10.6130/JORS.1996.9(4)1

Research Purpose

The purpose of the study is to identify the situation of domestic sustainable tourism according to sustainable hotels managers' opinions and experiences.

Research Questions

1. To practice sustainable, what is the difference of business model between Toucheng Leisure Farm and Footprint Inn?
2. What is the sustainable hotels managers' opinion about sustainable tourism certification?
3. What is the two sustainable hotels managers' assessments on the condition of domestic sustainable tourism?

Contribution

There are few cases which have got the CU-GSTC certification in Taiwan. The research collects and contrasts the only two certified accommodation operators' data to realize the influence of CU-GSTC certification in Taiwan and infer the condition of domestic sustainable tourism. The two pioneers' experience and perspectives can show the probability to other operators in tourism industry.

LITERATURE REVIEW

Sustainable Tourism

The definition of sustainable tourism is defined as "Tourism that takes full account of its current and future economic, social and environmental impacts, addressing the needs of visitors, the industry, the environment and host communities" by The World Tourism Organization (UNWTO).

Sustainable tourism not refers to a specific form of tourism, and the sustainability should be built in the foundation of all forms of tourism. To raise tourists' awareness about sustainability issues and promote sustainable tourism practices in their life, their satisfaction should be kept at a high level.

Sustainable tourism involves in the environment, economy and social culture. A long-term balanced development must be set up between these three dimensions. Therefore, there are three key points. First, the use of environmental resources is crucial. It should maintain essential ecological processes and help to conserve natural heritage and biodiversity. Second, the socio-cultural authenticity of host communities should be respected. And their built and living cultural heritage and traditional values also should be conserved. Moreover, facilitate inter-cultural understanding and tolerance in the meanwhile. Third, the economic operations should be feasible in long term. And socio-economic benefits (including stable employment, income-earning opportunities and social services) should be provided and equitably distributed to all stakeholders. And the poverty alleviation should be devoted.⁸

⁸ "Definition of Sustainable Development of Tourism," <http://sdt.unwto.org/content/about-us-5>, (accessed June 15, 2019).

Global Sustainable Tourism Council Criteria

The Global Sustainable Tourism Council Criteria are recognized and endorsed by the World Tourism Organization (UNWTO) and the United Nations Environment Program (UNEP), both of which are Permanent Members of the Board of Directors of the GSTC.⁹ The criteria are arranged in four parts: sustainable management, socioeconomic impacts, cultural impacts, and environmental impacts (including consumption of resources, reducing pollution, and conserving biodiversity and landscapes). And the criteria have two sets: one is GSTC Industry Criteria (for hotels and tour operators), the other is GSTC Destination Criteria.

GSTC Industry Criteria for hotels and tour operators is mapped out according to comments of out to close to 80,000 tourism stakeholders, comments from over 1500 individuals and analyses of more than 4,500 criteria from more than 60 existing certification and other voluntary sets of criteria.¹⁰

Tourism 2020 Tourism 2020: A Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy

In tourism industry, there are three trends currently. They respectively are globalization, the rise of digital technologies, and a shift toward localization. To cope with these challenges, there are five strategies in Tourism 2020 which is a four-year plan. The five strategies respectively are diversifying markets, stimulating domestic tourism, guiding industry transformation, developing "smart" tourism, and promoting experiential travel.¹¹

⁹ “Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC)” <https://www.gstcouncil.org/gstc-criteria/> , (accessed July 20, 2019).

¹⁰ “Industry Criteria (for Hotels & Tour Operators)” <https://www.gstcouncil.org/gstc-criteria/gstc-industry-criteria/> , (accessed July 20, 2019).

¹¹ “Tourism 2020: A Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy,” <https://english.ey.gov.tw/News3/9E5540D592A5FECD/a86221f5-7b5e-4df8-91b5-312189e7c89a> , 2019,03,08, (accessed May 5, 2019).

METHODOLOGY

In-depth interview is help to understand how the situation and its extension and intension.¹² In this study, the methodology used to collect the experience and perspective of interviewees concerning sustainable tourism and the criteria of CU-GSTC is semi-structured interviews. The researcher controls the process of interview to a certain extent by designing questions followed a preset outline. It can help the interviewee focus on the topic while responding. In semi-structured interview, the researcher will guide the interviewee to answer open-ended questions. It is an interactive process that the researcher uses probes after the interviewee finishes answering in order to encourage the interviewee to give some examples, elaboration, explanation or supplement. Semi-structured interview has two merits: First, the interviewee would think without care and worries because the process of the interview is not filled with limitations. Second, the reliability and the validity can be increased because the use of probing can make the interviewee reply deeply but not digressively.¹³

The interview questions can be divided into several parts: cognition of sustainable tourism, experience about practicing sustainable tourism, observation and suggestion about dealers and consumers in Taiwan, thoughts about the certification, judgment on the government's tourism policy and the condition of sustainable tourism in Taiwan. And questions would be adjusted according to the content and attitude of interviewees' response.

Before starting the interview, the researcher should have the interviewee sign an interview informed consent. The interview would be recorded from beginning to end in order to facilitate data sorting and analysis in detail and completely.

¹² 蕭瑞麟，〈不用數字的研究〉（台北：培生集團，民 96），頁 134。

¹³ “Conducting in-depth interviews: A guide for designing and conducting in-depth interviews for evaluation input,” http://www2.pathfinder.org/site/DocServer/m_e_tool_series_indepth_interviews.pdf, May 2006, (accessed June 20, 2019).

Both interviewees in this research are managers belonging to accommodation businesses which get CU- GSTC Hotel Certification. The mechanism of CU- GSTC Hotel Certification operated by Control Union is accredited by GSTC. The first Taiwanese accommodation operator receiving this certification is Footprint Inn. And There is another case, Toucheng Leisure Farm, which got another CU- GSTC Hotel Certification before February, 2019.

Toucheng Leisure Farm, which was established in 1979, is located in Toucheng Township of Yilan. It has more than a hundred hectares of land. The founder of Toucheng Leisure Farm used to be an educationalist. The company's culture is inheritance. Footprint Inn, which was established in 2014, is located in Jiji Town of Nantou County. The founder of Footprint Inn used to be a teacher. Its corporate philosophy is realizing and cherishing Taiwan's natural and cultural resources.

By contrast with Europe, there is not much literature about this topic in Taiwan, so the part of data analysis will be editing analysis style and present different perspectives instead of causal relationships.¹⁴

The researcher uses discourse analysis to analyze the interview's transcripts. TLF and FPI represents Toucheng Leisure Farm and Footprint Inn respectively. The procedures of data analysis can be divided in to several steps.¹⁵ First, transform the recording into transcripts and add annotation. Second, classify the content of transcripts based on the labels established according to research questions (Q1, Q2, Q3). Third, sort the data in line with concepts and events related to each question. Fourth, find theories associated with those concepts and materials which is relevant to those events to verify the information provided by the interviewees. Last, contrast the two interviewees' perspectives and find similarities

¹⁴ 程于恆。〈歐盟觀光發展政策—以法國奧德省永續觀光發展為例〉。碩士論文，淡江大學，2016。2019年7月20日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。

¹⁵ 張芬芬。〈質性資料分析的五步驟：在抽象階梯上爬升〉。《初等教育學刊》第35期（2010）：頁87-120。2019年7月20日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。doi:10.7036/JEE.201004.0087

and differences between them.¹⁶

The shortage of interview's data is that it cannot present the fact completely. It just can represent the interviewees' point of view. Also, it needs other materials to cross-checked its reliability. Thus, the study also takes interviewees suggestion to search materials as supplement. The sources of data are not only from interviewees' transcripts but also books, PhD dissertations, official organizations' publications, webpages, conference papers, research reports and journals. The data was collected from August, 2019 to October, 2019.

To avoid over interpret interviewees' response, they can confirm the transcripts including researcher's comment before it is analyzed. After analyzing the first transcript, if needed, there will be a second interview via telephone to complement.

¹⁶ 李慶芳，〈質化研究之經驗敘說：質化研究的六個修煉〉（高立，2013）。

DATA ANALYSIS

Sustainable Tourism's Meaning

TLF: The target of sustainable tourism is to promote the development of the whole society, which includes the justice between generations. There is an example that resources should be passed on, because the right to make use of resources between generations should be fair.

FPI: Its meaning is difficult to be defined clearly since it is involved in a wide range. Although there are 17 goals in SDGS, they affect and assist each other mutually. Sustainability is a lifestyle, and travel is a part of life. He put sustainability into practice and deliver this concept to customers by operating sustainable inn.

Business Model

TLF: The background of TLF is a leisure farm which is strictly supervised by government. At the beginning, the farm is instructed to focus on environment aspect and expend to production, life and ecology aspects afterwards. So, it has the foundation of environmental facilities which is recognized as excellent environmental education facilities and venues by executive yuan. It features on reproduction of life, atmosphere and value (such as cherish the resources) in the past rural times. Also, it provides local diet to introduce Yilan's environmental characteristics, unique agricultural products and eating habits to customers. In this farm, there are three kinds of industries: agricultural production, wine processing and leisure. The services it provides include accommodation, travel itinerary arrangement, agricultural products selling and catering.

FPI: Its manager, majored in the department of biology and used to run a seedling business, is rich in knowledge about environment field. It devotes to execute sustainability on everything has something to do with life. In addition to eco accommodation, it also provides

the service of sustainable travel itinerary arrangement, sells eco-friendly farming agricultural products, catering arrangement which is served without plastic and meat, and several kinds of lectures planning and design (such as sustainability, environmental education, education of food and agriculture, and culture). Moreover, he invites the local business and communities to attend activities about promoting local traditional culture.

Usually, most accommodation industry managers just display sustainable plans roughly and treat them as a feature. However, a declining traditional plum industry is integrated into FPI system. There are two purposes for this kind of operation. One is to preserve a traditional industry, the other is to help consumers memorize this inn by diverse manners and add a promotion channel. The manager plans to establish another cooperation which will concentrate on agriculture as some plans cannot be displayed in Footprint Inn completely and detailly. Subsequently, this hotel will gradually transform into an NGO.

Observation Of Domestic Operators' Sustainability Awareness And Suggestion

TLF: Everyone has the willingness for improvement. There is no absolute standard which can be used to justify whether their position is qualified, because many fields are involved in sustainable tourism and the standard is dynamic. There are many criteria at home and abroad, but it cannot be applied universally because of different background.

FPI: Some people think that this is just a trend that will disappear one day, because human being gets used to stay in comfort zone eventually. Most stores in rural area still ignore the existing problems and are unwilling to adjust in the case of preserving their tradition. These phenomena would put traditions in risk of loss. Moreover, something is turned into a commodity which is deviating from its essence currently such as eco-friendliness. This is the causation for confusion in values. And people cannot identify

eco-friendliness and sustainability. However, once let those operators know the potential benefits and provide them with incentives, they will make a change gradually. According to his experiences, their awareness is upgrading. Although they rejected at first because it is troublesome to practice sustainability in their businesses, finally they still have made some adjustments to some degree. There are two reasons: (1) This is a trend. (2) They need someone to encourage, give some benefits, assistance and instructions. Then, these changes of individual cases require to be integrated and promoted in order to form greater influence.

Suggestions For Other Accommodation Operators

In rural communities, they will be seen as an indicator which is very important to bring interests. They have more time to contact customers than other industries, so they can convey more concepts related to sustainability by various means like experience local culture, introduce local environment and products. Also, they can help local stores enhance according to consumers' preferences and demands in the case of preserving its tradition.

People usually think that they are absolutely right, because they just live in the world perceived by themselves. Yet, a sustainable world belongs to everyone. It is fundamental that accepting oneself is not absolutely right can gradually turn towards a sustainable world. Thinking critically, respecting diversity, communicating are the solutions.

Expectation For Cooperation

TLF: Cooperation should be targeted to achieve sixth industry's business model. Primary, secondary and tertiary industries are all irreplaceable. And it is helpful to highlight features of these industries' resources by integrating efficiently. There are some instances in TLF. They use local food as ingredients in their catering service, develop new products which are also made from these raw materials. Also, they support the local dealers by selling their products in TLF.

FPI: Most traders think that cooperation just needs to put each other's products and services together into a package with a lower price in order to increase its attraction. Nevertheless, each participant's right is equal in a cooperation relationship. The cooperation plan, drafted after mutual understanding, should have rationality between components for convincing consumers. It also can help the participants enhance.

Operators' Influence On Consumers

TLF: The impact is mutual rather than unilateral. Their compositions of the customer groups are diverse. Because some strategies are formulated to balance the needs of various consumers, consumers also raise questions and urge them to correct. They have been certified by the Environmental Protection Agency as environmental education field. So, they implement environmental education itinerary and lesson plan rigorously. TLF is a profit-seeking enterprise. In order to increase consumers' purchase intention, they will package the concept of sustainability into another form, increasing consumers' willingness to purchase products and services. It also can influence them indirectly (like realizing local culture). They would make adjustments and concessions for catering consumers demands. However, they still adhere to their principle in some cases.

FPI: Its manager takes a supported attitude. He thinks it is feasible. After he conveyed this concept by setting living conditions (such as providing facilities, supplies, and services that meet the criteria of sustainable travel), visitors gave positive responses. Their mentality is affected unconsciously. They have felt the comfort it brings to the mind and decided to change from themselves.

Motivation For Certification

TLF: Compared with foreign countries, domestic reference materials are rare. Staffs researching about sustainability in TLF are less than other organizations. So, they look for external resources and apply for some certifications. In the process of preparation, they can analyze their own situation and find directions for improvement from those criteria.

FPI: At the beginning, its manager has aimed to operate this inn sustainably and applied for environmental hotel certification. Then, he acquainted with Sustainable Travel Taiwan (STT) accidentally and acquire this certification with their suggestions and assistance. This certification let him understand sustainable tourism more clearly and detailly.

Difficulties Of Practicing Sustainable Tourism And Preparing For Certifications

TLF: It faces two problems. One is that they have fewer links to the local at first. Because it is large in scale and has more resources from themselves, its business model is mainly self-sufficient. Its employees didn't know where to start from in the beginning, but then they started to cooperate with the outside world after communicating with organizations (academic institutions, NGOs, and government agencies) engaged in environmental education. The other is high cost. They must concern about how to make the company continue to operate stably and even profit.

FPI: This certification is strict to data about energy, so FPI should collect their previous data from the official to set goals and make plans for the usage of energy.

Certification'S Influence

TLF: Consumers in Taiwan still take cost-performance ratio as the primary consideration rather than the acquisition of various certifications. It can find positive impacts by transferring observation objects from consumers to a wide range of stakeholders (internal

executives, employees, government agencies, and experts). To inside company, it can work more smoothly because of the consensus. To external environment, it is helpful to shape a positive image, meet potential partners, get more resources and advertise themselves on international occasions. Even getting some profits because of being a learning object. The advantage of this certification is that it regularly adjusts the criteria according to the actual situation, which is more dynamic and reasonable than the domestic certification. It also helps them progress continually instead of being satisfied with a qualified status. This certification also increases opportunities for contacting and cooperating with academic institutions and official institutions.

FPI: In the early days of being just certified, media focused on FPI. However, because the values of Taiwanese tourists have not changed yet, it is necessary to target foreign tourists as target consumers in order to exchange the substantial benefits. Certification allowed him to find a more detailed and clear direction to work hard.

Attitudes For Other Certifications And Plans In The Future

TLF: It has positive will to apply other certifications because the process of preparation is seen as another chance for learning and enhancing.

FPI: It keeps a pragmatic attitude. The acquisition of certification is not their priority. Because he wants to try to practice it with non-mainstream models like NGOs and transform the hotel into a supply subject.

Perspectives On The Government'S Policies Or Plans

TLF: The government still has a lot of room for improvement in basic tourism. It is also inferior to the local dealers with few achievements in sustainable tourism. Subsidy for this issue is necessary. The practice of sustainable tourism requires high costs to survive.

Moreover, people do not have enough realization of this concept. The subsidy can be used to prepare for associated certification and different forms of education for people.

FPI: The policy that everyone become rich is not possible because of limited resources. Sightseeing and traveling are different. The former is to follow the trend and take actions. The latter is to satisfy one self's physical and mental demands. However, the government's policies are usually for promoting sightseeing because their motive is to keep up with trend. And more than half the public just engage in sightseeing instead of travelling. There is an example which can be used to explain this phenomenon-skywalk. It is the original environment that truly meets human's physical and mental demands. In Europe, it is rare that destroying the environment is to carry out construction because of gaining more economic benefits brought by most of the tourists. Yet, this kind of phenomena are common in Taiwan. Often, once these constructions cause attractions to lost its own unique attraction and accompanied culture, stores nearby will promote other products and services which are imitated from other more popular tourist attractions. In this mode, the traders with more funds would domain the situation at last. And the number of visiting tourists would also decline. Usually, marketing company commissioned by the government designs government plan mainly with imitating other counties' or countries' modes instead of considering local unique resources. Superficially, those plans seem that they can obtain economic benefits. Because the latter method requires more preparation, it is more difficult for dealers to get support from the government.

Perspectives On The Government'S Travel Subsidy

TLF: It is unable to promote sustainable tourism. This policy just can promote economic development and increase tourism-related dealers' income in short term.

FPI: It destroys the balance of the accommodation industry's industry chain.¹⁷ Every business has its own target customers. Yet, the target customers fluctuate because of this policy. The business model that was originally designed with sustainability is no longer applicable. The traders encounter dilemmas while operating. The tourists cannot find suitable accommodation either (except for considerations the price).

Judging The Current Stage Of Taiwan's Sustainable Tourism

TLF: It is rough to label Taiwan's current condition with single developmental stage. Since various organizations are at different stage. There are two instances. One is that environmental education centers established by the national park were very popular in the past. Yet they didn't follow trends to enhance. Nowadays, they lose attractions to tourists. The other is that some communities are constructing in this direction and few communities have been matured. If they do not make some changes, they also will decline. Compared with the influence of the government, the local forces developed from internal to external (such as community construction and local traders' cooperation) are more complete and can last for a long time. It is certain that there are still many areas need to be explored and developed. For example, the promotion of local culture is insufficient in Taiwan.

FPI: Taiwan is still in the exploration stage. At present, it is actually only a foundation that traders aim at complying with eco-friendliness standards. It is more difficult to have progress especially when the government and private sectors have adverse intent.¹⁸ Aboriginal culture is an example. Once people just want to gain benefit from this culture without realization and maintenance, the culture will disappear eventually. The reason is that its

¹⁷ 林裕強、李俊毅。〈誰是目標客群？探討休閒農場遊客對低碳旅遊之願付價格及影響因素〉。《觀光休閒學報》第 19 卷第 1 期（2013）：頁 29-53。2019 年 10 月 20 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。
doi:10.6267/JTLS.2013.19(1)2

¹⁸ 林錫銓、楊惠婷、張琬青。〈少了邵族文化的日月潭觀光－文化觀光的危機與永續〉。《鄉村旅遊研究》第 3 卷第 1 期（2009）：頁 71-83。2019 年 10 月 20 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。
doi:10.30169/JRTR.200906.0005

nature has been altered into a living tool. Using economic benefit obtaining from culture conservation to maintain culture can generate a positive circulation. Because Taiwanese still mainly care about price and cost-performance ratio unlike Westerners, traders engaging in sustainable tourism related industries cannot gain physical and economic efficiency currently. We can start from arousing Taiwanese' attention to sustainability. Then, they are likely to start to change. The correct mentality is that everyone should progress together rather than highlight each other's gaps.

Existing criteria about sustainable tourism is superficial. It can comprehensively be discussed how to let the consumers achieve these goals and dealers can explore adversely about which aspects the consumers cannot accomplish.

CONCLUSION AND SUGGESTION

Toucheng Leisure Farm has been established for 40 years. Footprint Inn has been established for 5 years. To sustainable tourism's meaning, their managers respectively interpret sustainable tourism vertically and horizontally.

Domestic tourism related industries have gradually upgraded their awareness of practicing sustainable tourism, but they still need outside assistance to integrate. They have different expectations for their own role because of different scales. As a leisure farm, Toucheng Leisure Farm contains three kinds of industries: agricultural production, wine processing and leisure. So it aims for self-monitoring completely. Footprint Inn integrated its Inn with a traditional industry. Thus, it aims to fulfill the role of the leader and the mediator.

Both of them agree that the dealers can have influence on consumers. Because of diverse customer groups, Toucheng Leisure Farm sometimes compromises for the needs of the guests. But Footprint Inn always sticks to their principle. Toucheng Leisure Farm thinks like a businessman and bring indirect influence. However, Footprint Inn is just like a local people and influence the other stakeholders directly.

There are few domestic reference materials, so they can understand their own level and find a clear direction of effort by preparing for certification, which has positive impacts on the company's internal operations and external cooperation. In the future, Toucheng Leisure Farm will focus on obtaining other certifications and maintain the original leisure agriculture business model. Footprint Inn tends to find more possibilities by developing diversified business models and combining with different industries.

The government should think about satisfying people's real physical and mental demands instead of arousing the trend while making plans. Both of them deem that there are still many fields in Taiwan that need to be devoted. The concept of sustainability has not been widespread among Taiwanese. Hence, traders can start by changing the values of Taiwan's consumers. It need to be assimilated into products to attract consumers. It is fundamental that accepting oneself is not absolutely right can gradually turn towards a sustainable world.

APPENDIX

訪談同意書

您好：

我是文藻外語大學國際事務系的學生，目前正在進行畢業論文的研究。研究題目是「永續旅遊認證制度對旅宿業者經營管理層面的影響」，以通過 Control Union - GSTC 認證的旅宿業者為研究對象，而主要目的想了解業者對國內永續旅遊的看法及相關經驗，希望您能提供個人的想法、經驗和相關資料協助本研究進行。

本研究採用深度訪談法，約需 1~2 次訪談，每次約一個小時。同時，為了資料的整理與分析，希望您同意於訪談過程中錄音。錄音內容僅作為研究者分析資料及歸類統整之用，希望您能提供真實的意見，以增加研究資料的正確性。

若您對本研究有任何意見，歡迎隨時提供。再次誠摯的歡迎您參與本研究。

同意受訪參與本研究

受訪者：_____（請簽名）

同意研究者使用訪談過程中的內容

受訪者：_____（請簽名）

研究者：_____（請簽名）

日期： 年 月 日

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- “Conducting in-depth interviews: A guide for designing and conducting in-depth interviews for evaluation input,” http://www2.pathfinder.org/site/DocServer/m_e_tool_series_indepth_interviews.pdf, May 2006, (accessed June 20, 2019).
- World Tourism Organization, “Definition of Sustainable Development of Tourism”, <http://sdt.unwto.org/content/about-us-5>, (accessed June 15, 2019).
- Global Sustainable Tourism Council, “Industry Criteria (for Hotels & Tour Operators)” <https://www.gstcouncil.org/gstc-criteria/gstc-industry-criteria/>, (accessed July 20, 2019).
- Executive Yuan, “Tourism 2020: A Sustainable Tourism Development Strategy,” <https://english.ey.gov.tw/News3/9E5540D592A5FECD/a86221f5-7b5e-4df8-91b5-312189e7c89a>, 2019,03,08, (accessed May 5, 2019).
- Global Sustainable Tourism Council, “Global Sustainable Tourism Council (GSTC)” <https://www.gstcouncil.org/gstc-criteria/>, (accessed July 20, 2019).
- Sustainable Development GOALS, “About the Sustainable Development Goals,” <https://www.un.org/sustainabledevelopment/sustainable-development-goals/> (accessed April 20, 2019).
- 交通部觀光局。
<https://admin.taiwan.net.tw/Handlers/FileHandler.ashx?fid=90319cdb-c48e-4e18-8bd6-56188edb7203&type=4&no=1>，〈中華民國 107 年國人旅遊狀況調查〉。(民 108 年 7 月 1 日)
- 李素馨。〈觀光新紀元—永續發展的選擇〉。《戶外遊憩研究》第 9 卷第 4 期 (1996)：頁 1-17。2019 年 7 月 1 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。doi:10.6130/JORS.1996.9(4)1
- 李慶芳。《質化研究之經驗敘說: 質化研究的六個修煉》。(高立, 2013)。
- 周永暉、歐陽忻憶、陳冠竹。〈台灣觀光 2020 永續發展策略〉。《台灣當代觀光》第 1 卷第 1 期(2018)：頁 1-20。2019 年 7 月 1 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。doi:10.6348/TMT.201809_1(1).0001
- 林裕強、李俊毅。〈誰是目標客群？探討休閒農場遊客對低碳旅遊之願付價格及影響因素〉。《觀光休閒學報》第 19 卷第 1 期 (2013)：頁 29-53。2019 年 10 月 20 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。
doi:10.6267/JTLS.2013.19(1)2
- 林錫銓、楊惠婷、張琬青。〈少了邵族文化的日月潭觀光—文化觀光的危機與永續〉。《鄉村旅遊研究》第 3 卷第 1 期 (2009)：頁 71-83。2019 年 10 月 20 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。
doi:10.30169/JRTR.200906.0005

欣傳媒。〈旅@天下-58期 封面故事／觀光走向永續 資源生生不息〉，

<https://solomo.xinmedia.com/globaltourismvision/131101> 。 (民 108 年 7 月 1 日)

張芬芬。〈質性資料分析的五步驟：在抽象階梯上爬升〉。《初等教育學刊》第 35 期(2010)：頁 87-120。

2019 年 7 月 20 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。doi:10.7036/JEE.201004.0087

張軒瑄、林俐吟。〈從永續觀光與旅遊地生命週期觀點論述九份地區觀光再發展策略〉。《休閒與遊憩研究》第 5 卷第 1 期(2013)：頁 1-31。2019 年 7 月 1 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。

doi:10.6157/2013.5(1).1

陳庭芸。「澎湖永續觀光發展之研究」。博士論文，中國文化大學地學研究所博士班，2013。

程于恆。〈歐盟觀光發展政策—以法國奧德省永續觀光發展為例〉。碩士論文，淡江大學，2016。2019 年 7 月 20 日檢索自華藝線上圖書館。

蕭瑞麟。《不用數字的研究》(台北：培生集團，民 96)，頁 134。